

Do Charter Schools Hurt Students in Traditional District-Run Schools?

Christine P. Ries
Professor of Economics
Georgia Institute of Technology
September 2012

Executive Summary

This report presents the results of a research study designed to measure the prospective financial impact of charter school creation on each of the 180 school districts in the State of Georgia. The analysis compares the revenue lost by regular public school districts when a child transfers to a public charter school to the reduction in costs possible on such transfer. Districts that can reduce costs by more than the loss of revenue will actually gain financially when a child transfers to a charter.

Opponents of charter schools argue that increasing the number of public charter schools in a district will damage the district public school system. Those with special interests in regular district public schools¹ fear loss of funding and loss of control when charter public schools open with public financial support. They argue that authorizing charter schools within their districts will reduce financial resources available for the remaining children if ‘the money follows the child’ who leaves to go to a charter school.²

That concern sounds reasonable but fails to recognize the real economics of the situation. When a child leaves, either to go to a public charter school or for another district, the system loses some funding (depending on state and local laws). But the system’s expenses also fall because they have fewer children to educate. If the school or district’s ability to adjust and reduce expenses is greater than the loss of revenue, the system will actually **gain** financially when a child leaves. Just as schools and systems adjust when a child moves out of district, they can also adjust when a child moves to a public charter school.³

Research assistance by Jhanelle McLeod (B.S. in Economics and International Affairs, Georgia Institute of Technology '12) and Breona Jenkins (Georgia Tech ISYE student) is gratefully acknowledged. Review and discussion with Dr. Ben Scafidi and Mr. Kelly McCutcheon, President, Georgia Public Policy Foundation is also appreciated. The author is solely responsible for any errors.

¹ For a partial list of the special interest educational groups opposing the amendment see Appendix.

² Some parents have been told that the development of charter schools will mean cancellation of the band or athletic programs in the regular district schools.

³ The loss of students to a charter school requires less adjustment in systems where the school-aged population is growing. In this case, the regular district schools would simply grow more slowly than they would without the charter transfers.

In 2012, the Georgia General Assembly crafted a financial compromise and placed a Constitutional Amendment on the ballot for November 2012⁴. The compromise was intended to allow Georgia's parents and communities to develop a broader range of choices in public schools while financially protecting the existing, traditional district-based public school system. That amendment and its enabling legislation carefully protected local property tax funds and specified the amount of state funds that would 'follow the child' to authorized public charter schools.

In this study, we estimate the loss of revenue for each of Georgia's 180 school districts when a single child leaves the school (but remains living in the district) to attend a charter public school. We estimate the possible reduction in costs for each child transferring to a charter using each district's accounting for costs as published by the State School Superintendent's office. We compare the loss of revenue for each transferring child to the potential reduction in system costs and determine which districts may realize a financial gain for the remaining children when one student leaves the district school system to enroll in a public charter school.

Of Georgia's 180 public school districts, 129 can actually gain financially for each child that transfers to a charter school. For those districts, the possible reduction in costs for each withdrawal is greater than the reduction in state revenues. Gaining districts can potentially add an average of \$1,218 to the school district budget for each child lost to charters. In the highest case, the Atlanta Public School District can potentially gain \$6,507 for each child transferring to a public charter school.

The 129 districts that would potentially realize financial gains enroll nearly 1.4 million students. The average number of students for districts in this category is 11,448. That is, these are primarily the largest in terms of student enrollment and, therefore, the most likely environment for a financially viable charter school to emerge and be authorized.

As expected, the remaining 51 districts are primarily the smallest in terms of enrollment and number of schools. In total they enroll just over 164,000 students or 3,221 students per district and usually have 5 or fewer schools. In other words, students enrolled in gaining schools (89%) outnumber students in the potentially losing schools by more **than 9:1**.

It is highly unlikely that these 'losses' would ever materialize, however. Since Charters generally need to attract 800-1000 students to be economically and educationally viable they are unlikely to develop in districts with small school-aged populations. For example, the highest 'hypothetical loss' is \$2352 for the Pelham City School District with just over 1400 students and three schools. Since it is extremely unlikely that a new charter school would form in such a

⁴ The action required a Constitutional Amendment because of an earlier Supreme Court ruling that effectively denied the State's ability to authorize start-up public charter schools over the objection of the existing and established, regular district school boards.

small district, it is safe to assume that Pelham City and other similar small communities will not release any losses from charter formation.

The median loss for these districts is \$465, but it is highly unlikely that these losses would ever be realized.

Political Importance of Financial Considerations in the Charter Schools Debate

The headline on a recent article in the AJC announces “Money at the Heart of the Charter School Debate.”

“State spending on charter schools has emerged as a central element in the debate over whether the constitution should be amended to allow the state to authorize and pay for more charters.

In announcing his opposition to the proposed amendment on Tuesday, Georgia Schools Superintendent John Barge said the state should not create another path for approving charters when it has struggled to pay for the traditional public schools that are already operating.”

Calvine Rollins, president of the Georgia Association of Educators (GAE), is quoted in the The Americus Times-Recorder. Speaking of Georgia’s public school systems she says,

“They’re already strapped for cash,” she said. “Teachers are being furloughed. Students are not being in school 180 days ... If the austerity cuts to our local public education systems that have already been made were restored, then you would see a difference in personnel, adding those people back who have been laid off; you could restore the 180 days to our school system and the insurance that was paid to our non-certificated people could be added back. What local school boards are having to do is raise the millage rate. ... There are 171 systems in the state that are operating in a deficit.”

While these arguments sound reasonable, they ignore the possibility that most public schools will actually benefit by having fewer children and, therefore, lower costs. That is, if the reduction in school costs that comes with fractionally lower enrollment is GREATER than the concomitant loss of per-child state and federal funding the school and district is left with increased funds to spend on the children who remain.

For those districts, all parents, teachers and superintendents should encourage the creation of charter schools. Parents and charter school teachers get the innovation, choice, and student-centered programs that they are seeking. Regular public schools and districts have greater resources per student for those students and families that remain.

The Money that Follows the Child⁵

The compromise that garnered bi-partisan support for putting the question to the voters is complicated. It deals with the issues of ‘local control’ and state support by separating the funds and allowing only a fraction of the per-child revenue of district public schools to follow a transferring child to the public charter school.

The regular school districts fund schools from three main sources – local property taxes, state funding drawn from state income and sales taxes, and federal support. The proposed compromise requires that local funding from property taxes remains with the regular public school district if the child transfers to a charter but remains resident in the district. The share of revenue that had been provided by the state and federal governments go with the child to the charter school. If a child were to move out of the district that system would lose all three forms of support. If the family doesn’t move but transfers the child to a charter school, the district retains a significant share of revenue. In that case, the district retains the funds that are contributed by the local property tax revenue while losing only the state and federal portions of revenue.

As an example, consider a district system that is funded by Local Property Taxes (41%), State Taxes (48%), and Federal Support (11%). If a child’s family moves out of the district, the public school district loses all revenue. In the example below that is local (\$3700), state (\$4300) and federal (\$1200) for a total of \$9200.

	Public School District – Revenue for One Child	School District Revenue from Source Child Moves Out of District:	School District Revenue from Source Child Transfers to Charter while Residing in District	Charter School Funding for Child
Local Property Tax Funds	\$3700	\$0	\$3700	\$0
State Funds-Regular Education Budget	\$4300	\$0	\$0	\$4300
State Funds – Charter Compliance Budget*	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2100
Federal Funding	\$1200	\$0	\$0	\$1200
Total Operating Funding**	\$9200	\$0	\$3700	\$7600

*State compliance funding to bring charter school resources up to the legally mandated level of the 5 poorest districts in Georgia.

**Average district operating funding was \$8895 per child in 2011.

⁵ The Georgia Public Policy Foundation’s publication “The Financial Impact of State Charter Schools” contains a full, factually accurate and documented explanation of the financial impact of charter school formation.

If the child's family doesn't move out of the district, but transfers the child to a public charter school, the district retains the local property tax funds, but loses the state and federal funds. Thus, public school districts are better off by \$3700 when a family stays in the district and chooses a charter school. The district loses all revenue if that family determines it has no choice but to relocate to another district to find an appropriate school for the child.

The receiving public charter school doesn't receive the local portion of \$3700. It receives the state portion that "follows the child" (\$4300) and the federal portion of \$1200. A legal mandate requires that the state make up an additional \$2100 to bring total public charter school funding to \$7600.

As specified in their contract the charter public school agrees to educate the child for \$7600. If the child had stayed at the regular district school, the overall cost of education would have been \$9200. The state has paid an additional \$2100 to bring the charter budget up to the support level achieved for the 5 poorest districts in the state. The regular district public system retains \$3700 to use for the education of the remaining students.

Because this distribution of revenue leaves the proposed public charter school without sufficient revenue to meet the legal mandate for funding (QBE), additional funds from state revenues were required to bring the charter schools' resources up to a basic level.⁶ State School Superintendent Barge estimated that these additional funds might amount to \$430 million over 5 years.⁷ This would represent an increase in the commitment of the State of Georgia to education funding of less than 3% of the current education budget. To avoid the charge that this additional fund will reduce funding to the regular districts, the governor has drawn the monies from a separate account.⁸

Comparing Loss of Revenue and Possibilities for Reduction in Costs: Data and Methods

The argument that the children 'left behind' are hurt is only true if the amount of money transferred out of a system when a schoolmate leaves EXCEEDS what it would have cost to educate the departing child. So, to determine whether children are hurt or helped when one of their classmates transfers out we calculate and compare 1) how much money 'follows the child' and 2) how much costs are reduced with one less child to educate?

The example bellows follows on the earlier example, but extends to show how a transfer of revenue and subsequent reduction in variable costs result in a net gain for the district.

⁶ The Georgia Public Policy Foundation, "The Financial Impact of State Charter Schools."

⁷ He assumes seven startup charter schools will be authorized and funded over that 5-year period.

⁸ Gov. Nathan Deal, State of the State speech, Jan.2012, <http://gov.georgia.gov/press-releases/2012-01-10/gov-deals-state-state-address-charting-course-prosperity>

	Public School District – Revenue and Costs for One Child	School District Revenue from Source Child Moves Out of District:	School District Revenue from Source Child Transfers to Charter while Residing in District
Local Property Tax Funds	\$3700	\$0	\$3700
State Funds-Regular Education Budget	\$4300	\$0	\$0
Federal Funding	\$1200	\$0	\$0
Total Operating Funding**	\$9200	\$0	\$3700
Variable Costs per Child (78.5%)	\$7130	\$0	\$0
Fixed Costs per Child (22.5%)	\$2070	\$2070	\$2070
Funding Exceeds Costs per Child	\$0	-\$2070	\$1,630

In this example, the original regular district spends \$7,130 on costs that are directly related to a particular child’s education. When the child transfers to a charter school, the regular district can adjust by that amount. Since costs fall by \$7,130 and revenues decline by only \$5,500, the district retains a net of \$1,630. This can be a real gain for the students who remain in the traditional system.

Georgia’s Superintendent of Schools reports the revenues and expenditures of public school districts annually.⁹ Using this report we compared, for each district, the possible reduction in costs when a child leaves with the reduction in federal and state revenue. Our study utilizes the methodologies employed for accepted state-by-state comparisons of district finances and results in conservative estimates of the true financial impact of charter schools on district-schools. This method was also used in the seminal paper by Dr. Ben Scafidi for the Friedman Institute and results in a conservative estimate of the effects of increased charter and school choice on the financial health of regular district public schools.^{10,11}

⁹ School Expenditure Report Fiscal 2011 http://app.doe.k12.ga.us/ows-bin/owa/fin_pack_revenue.display_proc .

¹⁰ Dr. Benjamin Scafidi, “The Fiscal Effects of School Choice Programs on Public School Districts,” Published by Friedman Foundation for Educational Choice. March 2012

¹¹ Dr. Scafidi’s paper uses the Common Core of Data from the Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Statistics <http://nces.ed.gov/ccd/search.asp>

Using district budget and financial records from Georgia, we allocated expenditures to the categories of fixed costs and variable costs.¹² Fixed costs might represent costs of the building, salary for principal or office staff or other costs that pay for services shared by all students. These costs won't increase if more students come into the district and they won't decline if some students transfer out of the district to move or attend a private or charter-public school.¹³

Variable costs or costs like school lunches or textbooks depend directly on the number of children served and will increase or decrease proportionately with enrollment. That is, if enrollment falls, the school or district can cut costs without affecting the services offered to the remaining children.

The Results: School Districts that Benefit When Charter Schools Expand

Table 1 shows each district's loss of funding, potential financial adjustment and net gain or loss when one of their students transfers to a public charter school while continuing to reside in the district.

On average, Georgia's regular school districts spend \$8,793 per student per year. The average variable cost per student is \$6,841 or 77.8%. The remaining \$1,952 represents fixed costs such as buildings and administration that are required to run the whole school or district and cannot be reduced when enrollment declines.

We find that in 129 of Georgia's 180 school districts (72%), transferring a child into a charter school IMPROVES the financial picture for student remaining in the district schools. For those districts, the possible reduction in costs for each withdrawal is greater than the reduction in state revenues. Gaining districts can potentially add an average of \$1,218 to the school district budget for each child lost to charters. In the highest case, the Atlanta Public School District can potentially gain \$6,507 for each child transferring to a public charter school.

The 129 districts that would potentially realize financial gains enroll nearly 1.4 million students. The average number of students for districts in this category is 11,448. That is, these are primarily the largest in terms of student enrollment and, therefore, the most likely environment for a financially viable charter school to emerge and be authorized.

As expected, the remaining 51 districts are primarily the smallest in terms of enrollment and number of schools. In total they enroll just over 164,000 students or 3,221 students per district and usually have 5 or fewer schools. In other words, students enrolled in gaining schools (89%) outnumber students in the potentially losing schools by more **than 9:1**.

¹² A more complete data set for expenditures is the CCD. It includes operating and capital expenditures. However, it is not possible to accurately allocate Georgia capital expenditures to districts in a way that will conform to the definitions of fixed and variable costs. Therefore we applied Scafidi's estimate of short-run fixed costs of 22.2% (for Georgia) of total expenditures to the operating expenditures from the GaDOE Annual Report.

¹³ This statement assumes that the entering or leaving group is a relatively small percentage of the whole enrollment.

References

Georgia State Department of Education, Revenue and Expenditure Report, 2011
http://app3.doe.k12.ga.us/ows-bin/owa/fin_pack_revenue.display_proc

Gov. Nathan Deal, State of the State Speech, Jan.2012, <http://gov.georgia.gov/press-releases/2012-01-10/gov-deals-state-state-address-charting-course-prosperity>

Duncombe, William and John Yinger. “Are Education Cost Functions Ready for Prime Time: An Examination of Their Validity and Reliability,” Peabody Journal of Education, v86 n1, 2011, Pp. 28-57.

Georgia Public Policy Foundation, “The Financial Impact of State Charter Schools,” August 28, 2012. <http://www.georgiapolicy.org/the-financial-impact-of-state-charter-schools/>

National Center for Education Statistics, Institute of Education Sciences, Common Core of Data
<http://nces.ed.gov/ccd/search.asp>

Dr. Benjamin Scafidi, “The Fiscal Effects of School Choice Programs on Public School Districts,” Published by Friedman Foundation for Educational Choice. March 2012.

EXHIBIT 1

Georgia Public School Districts - Revenue and Cost Adjustments for Students Departing to Charter Schools

Size Rank	System Name	Enrollment	General Administrative Expense per Student	Total Costs per Student	Total Variable Costs per Student	Total Fixed Costs per Student	Revenue Follows Charter Student	District Gain for Loss of Student to Charter	Number of Schools	Graduation Rate
1	Gwinnett County	162,928	\$ 578.83	\$ 8,129.47	\$ 6,324.73	\$ 1,804.74	\$ 4,832.01	\$ 1,492.72	126	68%
2	Cobb County	108,507	\$ 228.42	\$ 8,115.41	\$ 6,313.79	\$ 1,801.62	\$ 4,462.68	\$ 1,851.11	113	73%
3	DeKalb County	97,313	\$ 501.78	\$ 9,334.80	\$ 7,262.47	\$ 2,072.33	\$ 4,750.94	\$ 2,511.53	136	59%
4	Fulton County	91,239	\$ 441.72	\$ 9,115.53	\$ 7,091.88	\$ 2,023.65	\$ 3,993.60	\$ 3,098.28	102	70%
5	Clayton County	50,225	\$ 353.59	\$ 7,658.25	\$ 5,958.12	\$ 1,700.13	\$ 5,044.68	\$ 913.44	62	51%
6	Atlanta Public	49,032	\$ 2,968.52	\$ 13,954.69	\$ 10,856.75	\$ 3,097.94	\$ 4,350.08	\$ 6,506.67	100	52%
7	Henry County	41,026	\$ 173.69	\$ 7,401.05	\$ 5,758.02	\$ 1,643.03	\$ 5,239.54	\$ 518.48	50	72%
8	Cherokee County	38,776	\$ 203.67	\$ 7,917.56	\$ 6,159.86	\$ 1,757.70	\$ 5,238.66	\$ 921.20	36	75%
9	Forsyth County	36,202	\$ 247.92	\$ 7,430.97	\$ 5,781.29	\$ 1,649.68	\$ 4,063.23	\$ 1,718.06	35	86%
10	Chatham County	33,857	\$ 442.24	\$ 9,615.82	\$ 7,481.11	\$ 2,134.71	\$ 4,623.94	\$ 2,857.17	49	54%
11	Muscogee	31,359	\$ 599.92	\$ 9,117.99	\$ 7,093.80	\$ 2,024.19	\$ 6,663.43	\$ 430.37	55	68%
12	Richmond County	31,329	\$ 311.42	\$ 8,675.86	\$ 6,749.82	\$ 1,926.04	\$ 6,219.76	\$ 530.06	55	54%
13	Paulding County	28,606	\$ 136.70	\$ 7,023.48	\$ 5,464.27	\$ 1,559.21	\$ 5,224.70	\$ 239.57	33	76%
14	Hall County	26,577	\$ 356.46	\$ 7,747.15	\$ 6,027.28	\$ 1,719.87	\$ 5,044.78	\$ 982.50	33	73%
15	Houston County	26,258	\$ 280.73	\$ 8,371.11	\$ 6,512.72	\$ 1,858.39	\$ 6,169.43	\$ 343.29	37	73%
16	Douglas County	24,661	\$ 340.24	\$ 8,453.10	\$ 6,576.51	\$ 1,876.59	\$ 5,297.69	\$ 1,278.82	33	71%
17	Bibb County	24,242	\$ 408.04	\$ 8,683.10	\$ 6,755.45	\$ 1,927.65	\$ 5,927.12	\$ 828.33	40	51%
18	Columbia County	23,429	\$ 130.23	\$ 7,446.40	\$ 5,793.30	\$ 1,653.10	\$ 4,854.60	\$ 938.70	30	76%
19	Coweta County	22,004	\$ 269.04	\$ 7,803.97	\$ 6,071.49	\$ 1,732.48	\$ 4,863.22	\$ 1,208.27	28	75%
20	Fayette County	21,290	\$ 269.23	\$ 8,538.31	\$ 6,642.81	\$ 1,895.50	\$ 4,566.50	\$ 2,076.31	28	78%
21	Newton County	18,950	\$ 233.53	\$ 7,803.70	\$ 6,071.28	\$ 1,732.42	\$ 5,758.70	\$ 312.58	23	64%
22	Dougherty County	15,628	\$ 460.39	\$ 8,495.33	\$ 6,609.37	\$ 1,885.96	\$ 6,230.38	\$ 378.99	26	54%
23	Rockdale County	15,374	\$ 528.71	\$ 9,139.29	\$ 7,110.37	\$ 2,028.92	\$ 5,258.59	\$ 1,851.78	18	66%
24	Carroll County	14,084	\$ 239.67	\$ 8,391.04	\$ 6,528.23	\$ 1,862.81	\$ 6,103.94	\$ 424.29	24	67%
25	Bartow County	14,035	\$ 365.53	\$ 8,429.40	\$ 6,558.07	\$ 1,871.33	\$ 5,871.13	\$ 686.94	19	65%
26	Whitfield County	13,526	\$ 281.96	\$ 7,283.74	\$ 5,666.75	\$ 1,616.99	\$ 5,667.79	\$ (1.04)	21	63%
27	Walton County	12,830	\$ 327.32	\$ 8,383.11	\$ 6,522.06	\$ 1,861.05	\$ 5,113.80	\$ 1,408.26	15	75%
28	Barrow County	12,582	\$ 244.60	\$ 7,815.29	\$ 6,080.30	\$ 1,734.99	\$ 5,474.35	\$ 605.95	14	64%
29	Glynn County	12,485	\$ 351.00	\$ 9,163.87	\$ 7,129.49	\$ 2,034.38	\$ 3,955.43	\$ 3,174.06	16	70%
30	Troup County	12,191	\$ 336.46	\$ 9,107.96	\$ 7,085.99	\$ 2,021.97	\$ 5,889.08	\$ 1,196.91	21	64%
31	Clarke County	11,864	\$ 553.64	\$ 11,811.08	\$ 9,189.02	\$ 2,622.06	\$ 6,156.31	\$ 3,032.71	20	66%
32	Effingham County	11,104	\$ 264.31	\$ 7,857.86	\$ 6,113.42	\$ 1,744.44	\$ 5,741.88	\$ 371.54	13	80%
33	Catoosa County	10,683	\$ 225.19	\$ 8,416.18	\$ 6,547.79	\$ 1,868.39	\$ 6,024.01	\$ 523.78	16	77%
34	Spalding County	10,265	\$ 332.40	\$ 8,388.47	\$ 6,526.23	\$ 1,862.24	\$ 5,818.05	\$ 708.18	18	59%
35	Floyd County	10,138	\$ 461.49	\$ 9,710.58	\$ 7,554.83	\$ 2,155.75	\$ 6,996.38	\$ 558.45	19	71%
36	Liberty County	10,113	\$ 295.68	\$ 8,639.82	\$ 6,721.78	\$ 1,918.04	\$ 7,236.26	\$ (514.48)	13	67%
37	Lowndes County	10,084	\$ 272.40	\$ 7,988.28	\$ 6,214.88	\$ 1,773.40	\$ 5,650.48	\$ 564.40	11	66%
38	Camden County	9,248	\$ 147.44	\$ 8,014.03	\$ 6,234.92	\$ 1,779.11	\$ 6,081.97	\$ 152.95	12	75%
39	Bulloch County	9,149	\$ 304.75	\$ 8,162.92	\$ 6,350.75	\$ 1,812.17	\$ 5,728.36	\$ 622.39	15	69%
40	Walker County	8,924	\$ 227.25	\$ 9,440.03	\$ 7,344.34	\$ 2,095.69	\$ 6,839.38	\$ 504.96	14	68%
41	Colquitt County	8,752	\$ 275.12	\$ 8,400.72	\$ 6,535.76	\$ 1,864.96	\$ 6,921.09	\$ (385.33)	13	76%
42	Marietta City	8,194	\$ 391.91	\$ 10,087.09	\$ 7,847.76	\$ 2,239.33	\$ 4,924.07	\$ 2,923.69	12	56%
43	Tift County	7,591	\$ 187.57	\$ 8,109.99	\$ 6,309.57	\$ 1,800.42	\$ 6,533.03	\$ (223.46)	11	72%
44	Murray County	7,482	\$ 302.55	\$ 7,476.71	\$ 5,816.88	\$ 1,659.83	\$ 5,954.37	\$ (137.49)	11	66%
45	Coffee County	7,435	\$ 346.90	\$ 7,951.52	\$ 6,186.28	\$ 1,765.24	\$ 6,656.39	\$ (470.11)	11	66%
46	Polk County	7,428	\$ 271.35	\$ 8,141.27	\$ 6,333.91	\$ 1,807.36	\$ 6,408.04	\$ (74.13)	11	60%
47	Valdosta City	7,419	\$ 329.87	\$ 8,832.91	\$ 6,872.00	\$ 1,960.91	\$ 5,733.58	\$ 1,138.42	9	55%
48	Bryan County	7,387	\$ 140.15	\$ 6,731.70	\$ 5,237.26	\$ 1,494.44	\$ 4,849.59	\$ 387.67	9	79%
49	Jackson County	7,241	\$ 346.36	\$ 8,600.90	\$ 6,691.50	\$ 1,909.40	\$ 5,031.10	\$ 1,660.40	13	81%
50	Gainesville City	7,172	\$ 492.27	\$ 7,594.82	\$ 5,908.77	\$ 1,686.05	\$ 4,984.05	\$ 924.72	8	59%
51	Dalton City	6,987	\$ 513.52	\$ 8,283.18	\$ 6,444.31	\$ 1,838.87	\$ 5,348.60	\$ 1,095.71	9	81%
52	Habersham County	6,879	\$ 307.49	\$ 8,960.54	\$ 6,971.30	\$ 1,989.24	\$ 5,761.92	\$ 1,209.38	12	68%
53	Gordon County	6,594	\$ 301.51	\$ 8,161.55	\$ 6,349.69	\$ 1,811.86	\$ 5,963.28	\$ 386.41	10	82%
54	Oconee County	6,478	\$ 275.63	\$ 8,290.89	\$ 6,450.31	\$ 1,840.58	\$ 4,706.05	\$ 1,744.26	4	92%
55	Laurens County	6,343	\$ 215.77	\$ 7,187.15	\$ 5,591.60	\$ 1,595.55	\$ 5,968.54	\$ (376.94)	8	75%
56	Lee County	6,134	\$ 146.62	\$ 7,107.39	\$ 5,529.55	\$ 1,577.84	\$ 5,206.98	\$ 322.57	7	66%
57	Ware County	5,655	\$ 322.66	\$ 8,993.55	\$ 6,996.98	\$ 1,996.57	\$ 7,150.01	\$ (153.03)	9	76%
58	Rome City	5,522	\$ 228.61	\$ 8,439.56	\$ 6,565.98	\$ 1,873.58	\$ 5,707.46	\$ 858.52	9	75%
59	Baldwin County	5,452	\$ 360.15	\$ 8,301.19	\$ 6,458.33	\$ 1,842.86	\$ 5,889.35	\$ 568.98	6	68%
60	Jones County	5,407	\$ 303.60	\$ 7,548.83	\$ 5,872.99	\$ 1,675.84	\$ 6,238.57	\$ (365.58)	8	72%
61	Decatur County	5,326	\$ 239.99	\$ 8,386.43	\$ 6,524.64	\$ 1,861.79	\$ 6,412.40	\$ 112.24	8	71%
62	Wayne County	5,142	\$ 268.35	\$ 7,752.40	\$ 6,031.37	\$ 1,721.03	\$ 5,723.30	\$ 308.07	8	62%
63	Thomas County	4,932	\$ 317.57	\$ 8,196.78	\$ 6,377.09	\$ 1,819.69	\$ 5,968.16	\$ 408.93	6	64%
64	Harris County	4,840	\$ 399.98	\$ 8,523.91	\$ 6,631.60	\$ 1,892.31	\$ 4,523.14	\$ 2,108.46	7	78%
65	Sumter County	4,803	\$ 349.20	\$ 8,482.55	\$ 6,599.42	\$ 1,883.13	\$ 6,454.05	\$ 145.37	8	63%
66	Madison County	4,748	\$ 378.50	\$ 9,032.30	\$ 7,027.13	\$ 2,005.17	\$ 6,770.76	\$ 256.37	7	77%
67	Thomaston-Upson	4,538	\$ 350.05	\$ 7,649.80	\$ 5,951.54	\$ 1,698.26	\$ 5,899.21	\$ 52.33	4	64%
68	Pickens County	4,459	\$ 343.00	\$ 9,213.76	\$ 7,168.31	\$ 2,045.45	\$ 4,736.52	\$ 2,431.79	7	81%
69	Carrollton City	4,457	\$ 355.79	\$ 7,813.35	\$ 6,078.79	\$ 1,734.56	\$ 5,278.82	\$ 799.97	4	82%

70	Burke County	4,381	\$ 584.36	\$ 10,406.59	\$ 8,096.33	\$ 2,310.26	\$ 5,461.65	\$ 2,634.68	5	67%
71	Grady County	4,340	\$ 291.50	\$ 7,460.46	\$ 5,804.24	\$ 1,656.22	\$ 6,298.17	\$ (493.93)	7	73%
72	Gilmer County	4,331	\$ 303.63	\$ 8,648.47	\$ 6,728.51	\$ 1,919.96	\$ 4,775.77	\$ 1,952.74	7	82%
73	Emanuel County	4,176	\$ 336.11	\$ 8,297.15	\$ 6,455.18	\$ 1,841.97	\$ 7,536.12	\$ (1,080.94)	7	76%
74	Cartersville City	4,094	\$ 407.70	\$ 8,525.36	\$ 6,632.73	\$ 1,892.63	\$ 5,005.79	\$ 1,626.94	4	76%
75	McDuffie County	4,059	\$ 379.08	\$ 8,203.42	\$ 6,382.26	\$ 1,821.16	\$ 6,255.98	\$ 126.28	6	77%
76	Crisp County	4,008	\$ 331.61	\$ 8,891.58	\$ 6,917.65	\$ 1,973.93	\$ 6,836.89	\$ 80.76	6	59%
77	Peach County	3,989	\$ 593.52	\$ 9,123.28	\$ 7,097.91	\$ 2,025.37	\$ 6,413.07	\$ 684.84	6	60%
78	Stephens County	3,974	\$ 367.99	\$ 9,583.30	\$ 7,455.81	\$ 2,127.49	\$ 6,502.51	\$ 953.30	6	82%
79	Lumpkin County	3,901	\$ 233.63	\$ 7,916.43	\$ 6,158.98	\$ 1,757.45	\$ 4,748.13	\$ 1,410.85	5	81%
80	White County	3,813	\$ 413.50	\$ 9,419.20	\$ 7,328.14	\$ 2,091.06	\$ 5,596.91	\$ 1,731.23	7	87%
81	Monroe County	3,787	\$ 364.36	\$ 9,373.93	\$ 7,292.92	\$ 2,081.01	\$ 4,786.50	\$ 2,506.42	6	78%
82	Franklin County	3,659	\$ 254.36	\$ 8,412.00	\$ 6,544.54	\$ 1,867.46	\$ 5,999.89	\$ 544.65	6	74%
83	Butts County	3,566	\$ 403.46	\$ 7,834.65	\$ 6,095.36	\$ 1,739.29	\$ 5,382.19	\$ 713.17	5	67%
84	Pierce County	3,505	\$ 319.70	\$ 7,938.12	\$ 6,175.86	\$ 1,762.26	\$ 6,412.42	\$ (236.56)	5	84%
85	Haralson County	3,474	\$ 360.56	\$ 9,405.07	\$ 7,317.14	\$ 2,087.93	\$ 7,047.48	\$ 269.66	6	57%
86	Pike County	3,463	\$ 328.31	\$ 6,779.16	\$ 5,274.19	\$ 1,504.97	\$ 4,791.93	\$ 482.26	4	85%
87	Tattnall County	3,461	\$ 262.86	\$ 7,599.58	\$ 5,912.47	\$ 1,687.11	\$ 6,780.61	\$ (868.14)	7	60%
88	Dawson County	3,461	\$ 298.02	\$ 9,583.88	\$ 7,456.26	\$ 2,127.62	\$ 4,536.00	\$ 2,920.26	7	74%
89	Calhoun City	3,423	\$ 324.96	\$ 6,895.15	\$ 5,364.43	\$ 1,530.72	\$ 4,597.88	\$ 766.55	4	80%
90	Worth County	3,395	\$ 312.24	\$ 7,608.49	\$ 5,919.41	\$ 1,689.08	\$ 6,182.05	\$ (262.64)	4	65%
91	Hart County	3,384	\$ 184.63	\$ 8,468.16	\$ 6,588.23	\$ 1,879.93	\$ 4,928.66	\$ 1,659.57	5	72%
92	Brantley County	3,384	\$ 257.02	\$ 7,640.98	\$ 5,944.68	\$ 1,696.30	\$ 6,409.54	\$ (464.86)	7	60%
93	Appling County	3,363	\$ 347.65	\$ 8,578.15	\$ 6,673.80	\$ 1,904.35	\$ 6,396.57	\$ 277.23	6	61%
94	Morgan County	3,272	\$ 226.86	\$ 8,760.18	\$ 6,815.42	\$ 1,944.76	\$ 4,868.97	\$ 1,946.45	4	86%
95	Elbert County	3,242	\$ 409.28	\$ 9,873.47	\$ 7,681.56	\$ 2,191.91	\$ 6,971.08	\$ 710.48	7	70%
96	Buford City	3,241	\$ 584.19	\$ 9,558.78	\$ 7,436.73	\$ 2,122.05	\$ 4,219.62	\$ 3,217.11	4	83%
97	Dodge County	3,219	\$ 278.88	\$ 7,998.97	\$ 6,223.20	\$ 1,775.77	\$ 7,129.19	\$ (905.99)	4	69%
98	Ben Hill County	3,197	\$ 311.22	\$ 8,187.67	\$ 6,370.01	\$ 1,817.66	\$ 6,736.33	\$ (366.32)	4	65%
99	Cook County	3,175	\$ 414.95	\$ 7,897.72	\$ 6,144.43	\$ 1,753.29	\$ 6,424.98	\$ (280.55)	4	78%
100	Berrien County	3,134	\$ 350.10	\$ 8,084.36	\$ 6,289.63	\$ 1,794.73	\$ 7,042.13	\$ (752.50)	4	67%
101	Washington County	3,127	\$ 389.41	\$ 8,971.75	\$ 6,980.02	\$ 1,991.73	\$ 5,674.89	\$ 1,305.13	4	74%
102	Fannin County	3,043	\$ 299.44	\$ 10,167.94	\$ 7,910.66	\$ 2,257.28	\$ 5,282.89	\$ 2,627.77	5	82%
103	Meriwether County	3,038	\$ 542.40	\$ 9,522.70	\$ 7,408.66	\$ 2,114.04	\$ 6,927.59	\$ 481.07	7	69%
104	Banks County	2,919	\$ 359.78	\$ 7,874.82	\$ 6,126.61	\$ 1,748.21	\$ 5,717.82	\$ 408.79	4	78%
105	Decatur City	2,902	\$ 678.60	\$ 12,989.19	\$ 10,105.59	\$ 2,883.60	\$ 5,070.58	\$ 5,035.01	6	89%
106	Toombs County	2,893	\$ 277.47	\$ 8,043.22	\$ 6,257.63	\$ 1,785.59	\$ 6,871.40	\$ (613.77)	5	69%
107	Thomasville City	2,853	\$ 439.50	\$ 9,055.48	\$ 7,045.16	\$ 2,010.32	\$ 5,800.11	\$ 1,245.05	5	57%
108	Jeff Davis County	2,832	\$ 301.92	\$ 7,406.65	\$ 5,762.37	\$ 1,644.28	\$ 6,387.41	\$ (625.04)	4	76%
109	Jefferson County	2,823	\$ 402.57	\$ 8,461.78	\$ 6,583.26	\$ 1,878.52	\$ 6,718.71	\$ (135.45)	6	74%
110	Jefferson City	2,757	\$ 336.86	\$ 6,651.38	\$ 5,174.77	\$ 1,476.61	\$ 4,604.34	\$ 570.43	4	90%
111	Putnam County	2,684	\$ 619.76	\$ 10,454.10	\$ 8,133.29	\$ 2,320.81	\$ 4,612.38	\$ 3,520.91	4	63%
112	Chattooga County	2,673	\$ 538.97	\$ 8,731.10	\$ 6,792.80	\$ 1,938.30	\$ 6,404.97	\$ 387.83	7	63%
113	Dublin City	2,609	\$ 604.21	\$ 9,941.20	\$ 7,734.25	\$ 2,206.95	\$ 6,709.58	\$ 1,024.67	6	54%
114	Union County	2,560	\$ 472.19	\$ 9,588.31	\$ 7,459.71	\$ 2,128.60	\$ 5,113.25	\$ 2,346.46	5	89%
115	Long County	2,528	\$ 344.64	\$ 7,051.08	\$ 5,485.74	\$ 1,565.34	\$ 5,976.85	\$ (491.11)	3	71%
116	Lamar County	2,480	\$ 568.12	\$ 8,315.25	\$ 6,469.26	\$ 1,845.99	\$ 5,528.85	\$ 940.41	4	67%
117	Vidalia City	2,438	\$ 210.03	\$ 7,051.30	\$ 5,485.91	\$ 1,565.39	\$ 5,626.01	\$ (140.10)	4	76%
118	Mitchell County	2,386	\$ 449.73	\$ 9,855.67	\$ 7,667.71	\$ 2,187.96	\$ 6,366.84	\$ 1,300.87	5	64%
119	Screven County	2,386	\$ 300.18	\$ 8,137.85	\$ 6,331.25	\$ 1,806.60	\$ 6,686.87	\$ (355.62)	3	82%
120	Oglethorpe County	2,363	\$ 440.07	\$ 8,807.86	\$ 6,852.52	\$ 1,955.34	\$ 6,050.58	\$ 801.94	10	70%
121	Bleckley County	2,341	\$ 775.46	\$ 8,388.14	\$ 6,525.97	\$ 1,862.17	\$ 7,545.54	\$ (1,019.57)	4	72%
122	Dade County	2,326	\$ 258.09	\$ 8,140.08	\$ 6,332.98	\$ 1,807.10	\$ 6,165.49	\$ 167.49	4	70%
123	Rabun County	2,299	\$ 409.48	\$ 10,044.12	\$ 7,814.33	\$ 2,229.79	\$ 4,137.58	\$ 3,676.75	5	90%
124	Brooks County	2,220	\$ 477.06	\$ 8,778.05	\$ 6,829.32	\$ 1,948.73	\$ 6,236.66	\$ 592.66	4	60%
125	Early County	2,154	\$ 501.24	\$ 10,042.69	\$ 7,813.21	\$ 2,229.48	\$ 7,699.51	\$ 113.70	3	72%
126	Jasper County	2,065	\$ 409.42	\$ 9,059.01	\$ 7,047.91	\$ 2,011.10	\$ 5,817.96	\$ 1,229.95	4	76%
127	Greene County	2,032	\$ 867.28	\$ 12,424.18	\$ 9,666.01	\$ 2,758.17	\$ 3,807.25	\$ 5,858.76	5	53%
128	Bremen City	2,013	\$ 524.61	\$ 7,623.19	\$ 5,930.84	\$ 1,692.35	\$ 5,804.89	\$ 125.95	4	93%
129	Heard County	2,000	\$ 387.38	\$ 8,641.72	\$ 6,723.26	\$ 1,918.46	\$ 5,814.68	\$ 908.58	5	78%
130	Candler County	1,948	\$ 503.24	\$ 8,143.39	\$ 6,335.56	\$ 1,807.83	\$ 6,978.73	\$ (643.17)	4	77%
131	Bacon County	1,910	\$ 311.20	\$ 7,992.10	\$ 6,217.85	\$ 1,774.25	\$ 6,911.45	\$ (693.60)	4	77%
132	Crawford County	1,796	\$ 367.12	\$ 8,171.97	\$ 6,357.79	\$ 1,814.18	\$ 6,220.17	\$ 137.62	3	42%
133	Macon County	1,709	\$ 486.18	\$ 10,393.28	\$ 8,085.97	\$ 2,307.31	\$ 7,139.48	\$ 946.49	3	64%
134	Evans County	1,698	\$ 475.32	\$ 8,282.09	\$ 6,443.47	\$ 1,838.62	\$ 7,008.35	\$ (564.88)	3	65%
135	McIntosh County	1,682	\$ 473.53	\$ 8,529.70	\$ 6,636.11	\$ 1,893.59	\$ 4,620.33	\$ 2,015.78	4	77%
136	Atkinson County	1,655	\$ 507.44	\$ 8,448.33	\$ 6,572.80	\$ 1,875.53	\$ 7,608.84	\$ (1,036.04)	4	78%
137	Telfair County	1,651	\$ 330.27	\$ 8,898.14	\$ 6,922.75	\$ 1,975.39	\$ 6,663.37	\$ 259.38	3	75%
138	Social Circle City	1,647	\$ 674.19	\$ 8,723.56	\$ 6,786.93	\$ 1,936.63	\$ 6,947.63	\$ (160.70)	4	69%
139	Charlton County	1,636	\$ 465.65	\$ 8,602.69	\$ 6,692.89	\$ 1,909.80	\$ 5,902.01	\$ 790.88	4	77%
140	Lanier County	1,617	\$ 434.29	\$ 8,082.41	\$ 6,288.11	\$ 1,794.30	\$ 7,317.37	\$ (1,029.26)	4	64%
141	Irwin County	1,595	\$ 547.19	\$ 9,495.34	\$ 7,387.37	\$ 2,107.97	\$ 7,310.48	\$ 76.89	3	56%
142	Wilkes County	1,575	\$ 530.94	\$ 9,189.57	\$ 7,149.49	\$ 2,040.08	\$ 6,769.22	\$ 380.27	4	67%
143	Seminole County	1,541	\$ 375.01	\$ 9,158.18	\$ 7,125.06	\$ 2,033.12	\$ 6,633.11	\$ 491.95	2	72%
144	Taylor County	1,531	\$ 512.66	\$ 9,361.70	\$ 7,283.40	\$ 2,078.30	\$ 7,634.89	\$ (351.49)	4	51%
145	Turner County	1,511	\$ 956.95	\$ 9,541.19	\$ 7,423.05	\$ 2,118.14	\$ 7,832.66	\$ (409.61)	3	71%
146	Terrell County	1,482	\$ 448.55	\$ 8,489.87	\$ 6,605.12	\$ 1,884.75	\$ 7,072.15	\$ (467.03)	4	76%

147	Wilkinson County	1,479	\$ 501.85	\$ 11,164.90	\$ 8,686.29	\$ 2,478.61	\$ 6,741.54	\$ 1,944.75	4	66%
148	Pelham City	1,407	\$ 583.47	\$ 8,215.13	\$ 6,391.37	\$ 1,823.76	\$ 8,743.30	\$ (2,351.93)	3	76%
149	Commerce City	1,404	\$ 581.29	\$ 8,691.14	\$ 6,761.71	\$ 1,929.43	\$ 6,280.00	\$ 481.71	4	84%
150	Jenkins County	1,403	\$ 530.31	\$ 8,938.56	\$ 6,954.20	\$ 1,984.36	\$ 7,535.36	\$ (581.16)	3	70%
151	Chickamauga City	1,385	\$ 482.91	\$ 6,450.00	\$ 5,018.10	\$ 1,431.90	\$ 5,070.66	\$ (52.56)	3	98%
152	Schley County	1,344	\$ 480.80	\$ 6,848.32	\$ 5,327.99	\$ 1,520.33	\$ 5,820.53	\$ (492.54)	2	76%
153	Pulaski County	1,342	\$ 707.29	\$ 9,833.05	\$ 7,650.11	\$ 2,182.94	\$ 7,922.78	\$ (272.67)	3	70%
154	Dooley County	1,341	\$ 547.75	\$ 10,506.31	\$ 8,173.91	\$ 2,332.40	\$ 7,860.12	\$ 313.79	3	58%
155	Trion City	1,338	\$ 291.65	\$ 7,288.65	\$ 5,670.57	\$ 1,618.08	\$ 6,654.48	\$ (983.91)	3	96%
156	Clinch County	1,296	\$ 689.48	\$ 9,117.23	\$ 7,093.20	\$ 2,024.03	\$ 6,235.68	\$ 857.52	3	86%
157	Marion County	1,292	\$ 744.26	\$ 8,452.15	\$ 6,575.77	\$ 1,876.38	\$ 6,329.09	\$ 246.68	2	75%
158	Wilcox County	1,269	\$ 460.45	\$ 7,941.18	\$ 6,178.24	\$ 1,762.94	\$ 7,036.98	\$ (858.74)	3	65%
159	Lincoln County	1,172	\$ 555.00	\$ 10,471.91	\$ 8,147.15	\$ 2,324.76	\$ 7,213.98	\$ 933.17	3	76%
160	Towns County	1,162	\$ 499.83	\$ 9,913.48	\$ 7,712.69	\$ 2,200.79	\$ 4,459.86	\$ 3,252.83	3	89%
161	Hancock County	1,133	\$ 1,494.19	\$ 9,915.36	\$ 7,714.15	\$ 2,201.21	\$ 5,674.64	\$ 2,039.51	3	84%
162	Johnson County	1,123	\$ 602.16	\$ 9,293.39	\$ 7,230.26	\$ 2,063.13	\$ 7,309.49	\$ (79.23)	3	80%
163	Randolph County	1,113	\$ 910.51	\$ 10,017.26	\$ 7,793.43	\$ 2,223.83	\$ 7,453.03	\$ 340.40	3	60%
164	Treutlen County	1,109	\$ 591.89	\$ 7,452.48	\$ 5,798.03	\$ 1,654.45	\$ 6,540.79	\$ (742.76)	2	80%
165	Montgomery	1,050	\$ 554.92	\$ 8,838.28	\$ 6,876.18	\$ 1,962.10	\$ 6,713.79	\$ 162.39	3	73%
166	Miller County	1,044	\$ 702.66	\$ 8,387.86	\$ 6,525.76	\$ 1,862.10	\$ 6,819.91	\$ (294.15)	3	84%
167	Twiggs County	944	\$ 978.09	\$ 12,074.67	\$ 9,394.09	\$ 2,680.58	\$ 7,681.56	\$ 1,712.53	3	60%
168	Wheeler County	940	\$ 586.73	\$ 8,561.64	\$ 6,660.96	\$ 1,900.68	\$ 7,366.18	\$ (705.22)	2	88%
169	Chattahoochee	927	\$ 1,158.37	\$ 9,264.94	\$ 7,208.12	\$ 2,056.82	\$ 8,467.48	\$ (1,259.36)	3	67%
170	Echols County	772	\$ 595.36	\$ 8,736.29	\$ 6,796.83	\$ 1,939.46	\$ 6,912.61	\$ (115.78)	2	77%
171	Warren County	711	\$ 822.21	\$ 9,715.48	\$ 7,558.64	\$ 2,156.84	\$ 6,775.00	\$ 783.64	3	75%
172	Glascock County	620	\$ 742.88	\$ 8,279.12	\$ 6,441.16	\$ 1,837.96	\$ 6,444.41	\$ (3.25)	1	80%
173	Calhoun County	615	\$ 1,302.29	\$ 11,217.78	\$ 8,727.43	\$ 2,490.35	\$ 7,254.35	\$ 1,473.08	2	61%
174	Talbot County	571	\$ 1,093.15	\$ 12,465.08	\$ 9,697.83	\$ 2,767.25	\$ 7,156.20	\$ 2,541.63	1	45%
175	Stewart County	499	\$ 1,444.84	\$ 12,733.55	\$ 9,906.70	\$ 2,826.85	\$ 8,385.11	\$ 1,521.59	3	76%
176	Webster County	432	\$ 1,067.78	\$ 9,752.64	\$ 7,587.55	\$ 2,165.09	\$ 7,112.13	\$ 475.42	2	67%
177	Quitman County	355	\$ 1,447.82	\$ 11,101.93	\$ 8,637.30	\$ 2,464.63	\$ 8,567.77	\$ 69.53	1	69%
178	Baker County	332	\$ 1,752.73	\$ 10,679.37	\$ 8,308.55	\$ 2,370.82	\$ 7,756.07	\$ 552.48	1	41%
179	Clay County	278	\$ 1,542.58	\$ 13,175.32	\$ 10,250.40	\$ 2,924.92	\$ 10,287.01	\$ (36.61)	2	40%
180	Taliaferro County	199	\$ 995.90	\$ 13,367.31	\$ 10,399.77	\$ 2,967.54	\$ 8,183.17	\$ 2,216.60	1	67%
	Average	6084	\$ 473.46	\$ 8,284.78	\$ 6,368.57	\$ 1,916.21	\$ 6,112.78	\$ 6,368.57	17	68%

Appendix A

Educational Establishment Groups Opposing School Choice Constitutional Amendment

Georgia Parent Teacher Association (PTA)
Georgia State School Superintendent John Barge
Georgia Association of Educational Leaders
Georgia Association of Educators
Georgia Association of School Psychologist
Georgia Federation of Teachers
Georgia Music Educators Association
Georgia Parent Teacher Association (PTA)
Georgia Retired Educators Association
Georgia School Boards Association
Georgia School Superintendents Association
Members of Georgia Legislative Black Caucus
Professional Association of Georgia Educators
Southern Education Foundation